| **Student Name:** Alvina |
| --- |

| **Motion**: THBT that the rise of fandoms has done more harm than good. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:     * Nice hook! I think you could have taken the hook further though; you could be like its leads to terrible situations - some emphasis here is definitely needed! * Set-up   + Fandoms can be good; what is good stuff?   + What are they going to be developed to? What’s the cause of this? Right now, this just sounds like the people become bigger fans of a celebrity; you do need to elaborate or at least point out what is the primer for this to happen!   + I think the set-up is too long; it was almost 02:13 by the time you moved on! * 1st - Stalking   + You seem nervous and scared! Remember that you need to sell yourself too in order for the argument to be taken seriously and to be legit.   + Why would the average person be at risk of becoming sucked into this whirlpool of thoughts? I think it would be beneficial to explain the overall culture that is attached to fandom culture that leads to this scenario!   + A good example here is the singer Christina Grimmie, who was shot dead by a superfan.   + I think the outcome was unclear; who was going to commit suicide? The artist? The fans? This became clearer later, but you gotta make sure you get to that point quicker!   Speaking time: 05:39.83, good work! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Liam |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that the rise of "Fandoms" has done more harm than good. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * Good volume and tone! Good hook! * Good signposting! * Gotta make eye contact Liam! Don’t be too reliant on your paper. * Rebuttal   + Stalking - They would have heavy security; I think to be fair, this is part of the problem. The fact that they need to buy heavy security is a problem itself!   + Suicidal thoughts - I understand that its extreme; but you do need to make sure to respond anyway after pointing out that it is extreme. You could say that most people would probably support the artist instead of the people condemning them! * 1st Argument- Friends   + Need to detail this more for me! Why is this a powerful way to make friends, why this is the best way to make friends, why the friendships made outweigh the harms, etc. These are all questions that need to be answered! * 2nd argument - Wasn’t too sure what this argument was about, impact is unclear. Make sure you’re moving through all the logical steps!   Speaking time: 02:53.11, lets aim for 4 next time! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Giselle |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that the rise of "Fandoms" has done more harm than good. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * Good hook! Very direct and effective. Good signposting too! * Clarifications   + Part is buying merch and we didn’t say it was bad for the idols; I think you gotta remember that this isn’t an actor debate - so the welfare and benefit of the idols isn’t automatically an important thing. Moreover, I think prop one did talk about merch being part of the problem? * Rebuttals   + Good call re: celebrities needing security.   + They gang up against other idols; how and why? How bad is this ganging up?   Argument 1: Sexualisation of idols   * What happens and why does this happen? Give me so impacts of this on an underage person; does it give them an unhealthy perception of relationships and how they should be dressed? * Gojo Fangirls is a good example. You could also mention Sabrina Carpenter and the types of performances she performs too! * I am however unsure of why fandoms are the most relevant cause of this issue; are fandoms really the main cause of the sexualisation of these idols? Wouldn’t the media and or company owners do this anyway?   Speaking time: 05:18.39, good work! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Aiden |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that the rise of "Fandoms" has done more harm than good. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * Good hook! Try to avoid really extreme outcomes like suicide though, unless you can 100% prove this to happen during your speech. * Rebuttal   + They could have a normal life instead of a celebrity life; this doesn’t explain that people should be living in fear though.   + Idols can choose what they wear; fair, but I think the proposition was saying that this can happen to them without their consent. Deal with that directly! * Argument: Helps support smaller artists   + Good argument! I think for this argument, you really need to give me some more details though. For example, some questions that really need to be answered first is why art is incredibly important and why new artists become popular is a great thing.   + You gotta try to avoid having so many awkward pauses in your speech - if you’re done with your speech just start wrapping up, tell me why the argument is important!   Speaking time: 04:14.73, good work! Lets aim for 5 minutes next time. | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Candice |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that the rise of "Fandoms" has done more harm than good. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * Good hook! I like that you were pretty aware and cognizant of the other side's position and or argument. Good example for Lana Del Rey. * Fans create unnecessary drama; how does this happen? You should actually go further to talk about how these fans actually try to control the artists, meaning that they expect the artist to follow their ideas of how they should be and act. * Also, what is the impact of this beef? It sounds like this is just a pretty petty few texts. You wanna make sure to tell me how this really affects online discourse, etc. Does it make things so much more toxic? * Good argument re: idolisation culture. * I really really need more impacts from you! If you are rebutting the other side, tell me about how their arguments impact the world in a negative way, etc.   Speaking time: 04:16.85, let's aim for 5 minutes next time !  Good job Candice!! Big improvements today. | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Andrew |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that the rise of "Fandoms" has done more harm than good. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * Try to make your hook more impactful!! Give me some emotions and or contrast. * Good signposting! * Rebuttal   + Harassment - I understand where you are coming from that a true fan would not want to harm the artist; but gotta remember this isn’t a perfect world with rational people. The better response here would be to explain that this is pretty far and detached from the fandoms. I know you said it isn’t their fault - but why so?   + Artists expect hate and backlash - Tell me why this is true! Good rebuttal. I think you can take it further to explain that most celebrities are trained to be different and disregard these comments, thus reducing the impact!   + Suicidal incidents of idols - I think you want to point out that this is a pretty rare scenario; I dont think the right path is to blame them for this though - you could explain that look, its true that this happens, but we have taken strong moves against the perpetrators; e.g., strong laws, etc.   + I get the hating angle on bad idols - why is this exclusive to the fandoms though? * I get that some artists don't get this hate - but remember there are considerations here like gender, etc! Female artists are scrutinised way more than a male artist. * You got into the clash really late!! Time management was an issue in this speech. * Remember; you are suggesting reasonable things but you must go further to explain this out for me!   Speaking time: 05:48.36, good work! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Amanda |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that the rise of "Fandoms" has done more harm than good. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * I think that was a solid observation in the hook; but I think you really need to sound a bit more assertive! Give me some intensity here. * Re: communities. I understand that conflict can happen - but I really need more details. You could talk about how stan culture really is quite devoid of logic and its mostly vibes. If there is a perceived slight against someone, then the fans go for the person who did something against the idol. TLDR; need more details to do. * Re: Marilyn Monroe - you could also mention that the decline in fame for an artist is also a really tough thing to face. Tell me the impacts of how we perceive Marilyn Monroe today! It has spillover effects for how society as whole treats women, etc. * Good argument that people may not really consent - you could also mention that fame itself is pretty lucrative. Even then, consent can be withdrawn - the difference is that in this case, celebrities can’t. * The tone at the end when you were talking about how all idols aren’t bad people is the tone I want you to take on for your speeches! It’s persuasive. * Time management is a problem!! Entered the clashes at 4:58. * Fandom hatred; how does this impact people and their interests?   Speaking time: 05:40.11, good work! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Andrew |
| --- |

| **Motion**: TH, as the animal rights movement, would aggressively shame non-vegetarians. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * Nice hook, but I feel like you could have employed a tone that was more assertive and or emotional here to add impact to the hook. Also, you wanna make sure that you are getting into your argument a bit sooner. 1:00 minute on a hook is a bit too long. * Nice signposting! * Why is it likely for you to start arguing back? Fair enough that shaming might be unreasonable, but you gotta analyse this. * You can also mention the fact that most people are actually pretty pro eating meat. How does this affect the way the arguments are received, etc? * When you say this policy of shaming will spread hatred, what do you mean? How will this hatred manifest and appear? * You want to assume the best of the proposition though; what if shaming works? What if it truly causes behaviour changes? You wanna do the even if; why is this something we truly cannot afford to do as the animal rights movement? * You gotta up the volume and tone! I need more swagger and flow from you. You’re saying smart stuff, but it won’t be received well if you don’t sell it. * You also wanna consider the potential drawbacks of your case and explain why those don’t matter as much!   Speaking time: 05:28.81, nice work! | | | | | | |